



PROJECT END LINE EVALUATION REPORT:

Strengthening Cooperative Training for Enhanced Employment of Women and Youth (SCOTEEWAY) Project in Addis Ababa: Conducted by MG Consultancy and LIWAY Project

Prepared by:

MG Consultancy

January, 2023

Address:

Tell: +251 911 24 69 84

Email: misganaw@2mgconsultancy.com

www.2mgconsultancy.com

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Acronyms

AATVTTDB	Addis Ababa TVT and Technology Development Bureau
HR	Human Resource
KII	Key Informants Interview
LIWAY	Livelihood Improvement for Women and Youth
LEIDB	Labor Enterprise Industry Development Bureau
MC	Mercy Corps
MG	MG consultancy
NGO	Non-Governmental Organizations
MSD	Market System Development
MoLS	Minister of Labor and Skills
PTC	Polytechnic College
PWDs	Person With Disability
SCI	Save the Children International
Sida	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
SCOTEEWAY	Strengthening Cooperative training for Enhanced Employment of Women and Youth
TNS	Techno Serve
TOR	Terms of Reference
TVT	Technical and Vocational and Training

SECTION-1

Background Information of the Project, and Purpose of the End Line Evaluation

1.1 Organization of the Report

To organize this report MG Consultancy has included a project background as a basic information and clarified the project purpose and process of evaluation; the report is also describes methodology and evaluation activities carried out. The rest report presents the evaluation findings including stakeholders' perceptions, and findings emerging from the analysis of documents and of beneficiaries' responses. Relevant conclusions and recommendations are presented section by section. This project evaluation report is submitted in response to the assignment award for MG Consultancy to implement the project called "Strengthening Cooperative Training for Enhanced Employment of Women and Youth (SCOTEEWAY) in Addis Ababa".

1.2 LIWAY Program Background

Livelihood Improvement for Women and Youth (LIWAY) is a nine- years programme (July2017 to June2024) funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) and EKN: July 2022 – June 2026. The programme implemented by a consortium of partners led by SNV Netherlands Development Organization and Mercy Corps (MC), TechnoServe (TNS) and Save the Children International (SCI). The overall objective of the programme is to contribute to sustainable poverty reduction and social stability in Addis Ababa through improved livelihoods. The specific objective is to increase incomes of 257,000 poor people (50% women and 75% youth) through increased access to wage and/or self-employment opportunities. The programme has been working in four prioritized systems namely Micro and Small Enterprise system led by SNV, Labor System led by Mercy Corps, Medium and Large Enterprise led by Techno Serve and Skill system by Save the Children (SCI).

The programme uses Market System Development (MSD) approach to guide the design and implementation of its interventions. It is an approach to developing market systems so that they function more effectively, sustainably and beneficially for poor people (in LIWAY case, primarily for women and youth in Addis Ababa).The programme envisages developing sustainable market based solutions, embedded in the market dynamics, through public and private entities. This will help to ensure ownership and scaling by the key market players beyond the project period without external supports. (**LIWAY brief leaflet**).

1.3 Project Implementing Organization

MG Consultancy is a private consultancy company with table rich experience in industry sector pre-employment awareness creation and work engagement training to stimulate investment in private enterprise sectors in order to create jobs and increase household income for the poor, chiefly young women. Its table reach experience enabled to compute and win a one year innovative project from Livelihood Improvement for Women and Youth (LIWAY) Program of Mercy Corps and Save the Children International on June 01,2021. Since then MG was implementing project named “Strengthening Cooperative Training in Short Term courses for Enhanced Employment of Women and Youth in Addis Ababa”. The purpose of the project as established in the original document of June01, 2021, was to create livelihood opportunities of 1,600 youths and women with low schooling through provision of high-quality cooperative training in short term training programs in one year. The project had an original duration of one year (June 01,2021 to May 30,2021); The duration was subsequently extended to October31, 2022 with project amendment of the major project outcomes including target number changes-1270 youth and women and then again to Dec,2022 in order to ensure consolidation of project amendments related to a challenge to reach the planned targets due to the labor market distortion with multiple actors and accordingly the project revised its activities for second time and focused to conduct project evaluation study to share the findings with stakeholders and key actors of the sector and discuss on labor market and job opportunity creation situations of Addis Ababa City to bring sustainable solution for both supply and demand side actors in general (*see project document, project amendments and stakeholders workshop ToR in annexes*).

1.5 Evaluation Process

The evaluation was conducted between October and November 2022. This evaluation is the end line project evaluation of labor market key actors which includes selected TVT colleges, Garment Enterprises and Job seekers who received work readiness training and linked for job opportunity at Garment Enterprises and other project key stakeholders such as Addis Ababa TVT Industry Development Bureau, Labor Enterprise and Industry Development Offices.

1.6 The Expected Accomplishments based on project amendment#1 were defined as follows:

- a) Partnership established and tested between 9 TVTs and 10 Garment Enterprises.
- b) Partnership strengthened between 7 TVTs and 10 Garment Enterprises.
- c) Practical skills of trainees improved at 10 Enterprise facilities.
- d) At least one to three updated short-term training modules as per employers’ demand and trainees’ gap.

- e) 1, 270 job seekers acquired skills for wage employment and secure wage employment.
Refer annex for revised work plan.

1.7 Indicators of Achievement

The following indicators of achievement which were formulated in project base line survey and were intended to aid in determining the extent to which the aforementioned expected accomplishments were evaluated and documented accordingly:

Indicator 1: Proportion of workers turnover rate from the total recruited workers in the month.

Indicator 2: Number of need-oriented curricula developed.

Indicator 3: Partnership level between TVT and Enterprises.

(a) No. of MoU among TVT College and Enterprise to deliver mutual effort and (b) Experience of regular platform meeting.

Indicator 4: Satisfaction of employers on TVT trainees in garment production skill.

Indicator 5: Experience of cooperative trainings for short term courses.

Indicator 6: Practical experience sharing as a result of cooperative training facilitated among TVT and Enterprise experts. *Refer project base line survey.*

1.8 Planned Activities

The following activities were originally planned to achieve the expected accomplishments:

- a) Learn the demand of employers for short –term trained workforce.
- b) Map out TVT colleges that match with the demand and other characteristics of requirements.
- c) Facilitate establishment of partnership between TVT colleges and employers/enterprises for supporting each other's goal. The partnership of provision of cooperative trainings is based on mutual benefit and is demand driven (win-win approach); demand side is saying they have problem at getting quality and relevant skills, and study shows the supply side is severely limited at producing quality labor alone. Therefore, MG Consultancy will meet both sides demand through a win- win approach (partnership).
- d) Update or redesign existing short-term training curriculum (if requested by enterprises) to fit the labor market demand in close consultation with TVT and enterprises.
- e) Design customized industry trainers' facilitation or methodology guideline.
- f) Prepare and sign tri-party training agreement for provision of customized cooperative training.
- g) Recruit interested unskilled or skilled job seekers youths and women for training in close collaboration with sub city and woreda level job creation offices.
- h) Facilitate registration and acceptance of trainees at TVT and enterprises.

- i) Follow up progress of students during training.
- j) Support Industry/enterprise to maintain trained targets for wage employment.
- k) Assist those trained targets that opt to open or run their own business after training.
- l) Follow up, monitor, and document lessons learnt.

1.9 Project End Line Evaluation Objective and Scope

The objective of this evaluation is to assess the performance of the project and develop specific recommendations for major stakeholders to promote sustainable and long-term impact to women and youth job seekers through cooperative trainings.

In line with the evaluation objective, the scope of the evaluation covers all the activities conducted under the project, with a focus on the amended activities. The evaluation reviewed the project benefits occurring to the project key actors and examined challenges in implementing the project to impact women and youth job seekers through cooperative training.

In summary, the evaluation assessed:

- The designed project impact in providing market based trainings, boosting quality skills and increasing employment opportunities in targeted sub-cities of Addis Ababa.
- The work relationship between TVT and Industries.
- If functional cooperative training is created for short term trainings/courses and see the practice. And
- Examined challenges in implementing the project and put strong recommendations.

Scope of the Study: The project end line evaluation has covered three actively engaged Sub-Cities with the project in Addis Ababa. The end line evaluation targeted key partners at project implementation areas; (1) Three actively engaged public TVT colleges in Addis Ababa (2) Three Industries/ Enterprises those who were actively working with the project activities to learn the experience and challenges of employers in collaborating short term training courses and creating employment opportunities as well as in creating working relationship with TVT colleges and 3) women and youth job seekers who are linked at three targeted enterprises to assess their satisfaction on created employment opportunity. 4) Addis Ababa TVT and Technology Development Bureau and 5) Woreda level Labor Enterprise Industry Development Offices.

1.10 Methodology and Limitations

The evaluation used the following data-collection methods to assess the results and outcomes of the work of the project:

- a) **Desk Review**- the project document, quarterly and semi-annual reports, monthly monitoring progress reports, stakeholders' regular platform workshop and meeting reports and other implementing partners' posters/ brochures were reviewed, *refer attached project periodical reports, work shop reports and brochures.*
- b) **Survey**- Close ended structured questioner telephone survey was used to collect the opinion, attitude and practices of beneficiaries. Telephone contacts from beneficiary data tracking table were used and able to interview both type of job seekers (those who received training only and linked for job opportunity). Eighty eight responses to 200 calls collected, the reason for this was most of the telephone numbers were not working and some other job seekers were used other persons telephone number so that, this has complicated to reach the beneficiaries. According to the telephone interview conversation the reason for leaving their job is more or less similar to Sub-City to Sub-City and moreover, the interviewed beneficiaries were ensured that their colleagues were also victims of the same reason. This will be discussed in detail in result section. Therefore, the consultants understood that the collected information will be enough to generalize the opinions, attitude and practices of the trained and job linked beneficiaries. *Refer annex---for survey questioner and sample voice records.*
- c) **Key Informant Interview (KII)**-Interviews were carried out with project key partners (TVT colleges and Industries) and government key stakeholders mainly with TVT training department heads and deans; Enterprise owners and managers and Woreda level labor enterprise industry development offices in order to understand the relevance, effectiveness and sustainability of the interventions in line with the project outcome and output deliverables. The data collection tools for these interviews were personal interview to get in-depth information on the subject matter. Generally, eight interviews were conducted with purposively selected key partners. The collected information is more or less similar along three key partners and the information has strengthened the findings collected from the monthly monitoring visits. *Refer for attendance and recent monitoring visit report in annex.* The representatives were asked to answer for intervention impact, practices and working relationships so far developed from the project and challenges faced during implementing the cooperative trainings.

1.11 Constraints and Limitations

Ideally, it would have been good to meet beneficiaries face- to- face and conduct survey, however, the majorities of the beneficiaries have left their job due to different reasons, confirmed with monthly monitoring reports and meeting them at Woreda level was also

unpractical as they are usually in different situations like joining other jobs and some others were not interested to meet us for interview purpose only. Therefore, the consultants employed telephone call survey method to collect the required data. Through this tools considerable amount of information were collected and in addition, asking question through telephone enabled interviewees to provide elaborated answer for each question. This was taken as an opportunity to ensure the general data quality and enabled to draw more views and realities of the job finding opportunities and challenges. This will be elaborated in result section.

1.12 Evaluation Criteria, Issues and Questions

The following evaluation criteria, issues and questions established:

1.12.1 Relevance

- How aligned were the delivered activities with the priorities and interest of the targeted actors?
- How far the key partners working relationships has developed due to this intervention?

1.12.2 Effectiveness

- How satisfied are the project`s key actors including Job seekers with the services they received?
- What are the results identified by project key actors and beneficiaries?
- What are the opportunities and barriers/ challenges to produce qualified trainees in short term courses and creating sustainable job opportunities for women and youth job seekers?

1.12.4 Sustainability

- The overall project implementing process to ensure sustainable and long tern impact to women and youth job seekers through cooperative trainings.
- Collaboration and coordination mechanisms between the project key actors
- Presence of the platform to share experiences and lessons learned

1.12.5 Specific Questions

Specific questions for each actor including job seekers are attached in annex separately.

SECTION-2

Project End Line Evaluation Results and Findings

This section begins with an overview of the main results and findings of the evaluation. General aspects and evaluation questions are shown in relation to the overall project, while results for more specific questions are shown for the key stakeholders that participated in the project.

2.1 evaluation Findings

Specific explanation and justifications of the qualitative and quantitative assessment of key project stakeholders provided below. To better understand the level and quality of results achieved by the project, a rating system was established for each evaluation criteria.

The rating reflects the evaluation team's informed judgments, based on qualitatively and quantitatively captured data collected during the interview. Ratings for non-quantifiable indicators require that qualitative assessments be made. These were affected through a review of the data and analysis of the interviews conducted during the course of the evaluation. The criteria for these assessments were established using a regular Likert scale rating. This rating system is based on a qualitative standard scale; therefore, results are to be considered an indicative evaluation of compliance with the project document and project base line survey in terms of performance of implemented activities and quality of achieved results. The ratings are corroborated and fully supported by the qualitative and quantitative data analysis of the evaluation. The quantitative data which were collected through telephone interview from job seeker were reach information as the respondents` had an access to talk more than to choose specific answer and the survey record enabled the researchers to capture more quality information related to the subject matter. The quantitative analysis raw data and records are documented in separate annex. The standard scale categories are as follows:

- **Highly satisfactory:** in addressing expected outcomes with high standards of performance.
- **Satisfactory:** generally addressed the expected outcomes with the project document.
- **Unsatisfactory:** partly addressed the expected outcomes however, with limitation and weaknesses in some areas.
- **Highly unsatisfactory:** not addressed the expected outcomes of the project document at all.

The main findings are presented based on the identified evaluation criteria in section one under 1.12 (relevance, effectiveness and sustainability).

2.1.1 Relevance

Relevance	Highly unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Satisfactory	Highly satisfactory
Alignment of the delivered activities with the priorities and interest of the targeted actors				X
The key partners working relationship development due to the project intervention				X

Finding 1: Strengthening Cooperative Training for Enhanced Employment of Women and Youth Project was found to be highly relevant in terms of the priorities of targeted actors including job seekers

The project`s relevance was assessed in terms of its importance to labor supply and demand side actors specific needs.

The project job seekers selection criteria in targeting women and youth with low schooling was found highly relevant to the actual problem of the Addis Ababa City administration labor supply and demand side actors. Because the targeted job seekers data base record at Woreda Labor Enterprise Industry Development Office (Woreda LEIDO) and on spot local job advertisement data revealed that the majorities of job seekers were found to be women and youth with low level of educational status. Similarly, the job seekers survey result confirmed that, out of 88 respondents` only two were men. And age wise 38 (86%) of them were with age range between 26 to 30 years. The rest 18 to 20, 31 to 35 and above 35 were rated as 6(7%), 18(20%) and 0 respectively. Their educational background were also traced and recorded as follow: 48(54.5%), 22(25%), 8(9%), 6(7%) and 4(5%) of them were rated as with 8th-12th grade, basic reading and writing skills, below 8th grade, degree and above and TVT graduates` respectively.

In addition, targeted enterprises particularly garment factories are also accepting beginner young women with basic writing and reading skills and train them according to its needs to fill

the gap of labor turnover. According to the KII of the garment factory owners and experts; the biggest challenge of the sector is high labor turn over and as a result the factories are busy with daily vacancy announcement and hiring schedule. Moreover, the collected information from public TVT supported the relevance of the cooperative training modality as the system enabled job seekers to be linked for job opportunity up on completion of the job readiness training. This was taken as an excellent experience comparing with the previous experiences that; there were a trend to see the same job seekers repeatedly for different training package as there were no a platform to link the trained job seekers to specific Industry.

The above survey results indicated that the project was worked with the right targets and the findings are found to be a justification for the necessity of the created cooperative training modality. Moreover, the intervention was designed to address the labor actor concerns such as high labor turnover and job linkage.

Finding 2: The key partners working relationship development due to the project intervention

The project key actors interview confirmed that, the workshops, meetings and memorandum of understandings signed among partners created effective communication in identifying mutual interests and opportunities to solve challenges in producing skilled labor and creating employment opportunities. The commitment of partners were progressively developed and the project has able to sign about five bilateral and six tripartite agreements with key government labor stakeholders and associations; and Enterprises and public TVT colleges including MG Consultancy respectively. The above findings revealed that the created partnership has improved working relationships of the key actors as compared to the base line study finding which was documented as nil. *Refer to the project base line survey indicator.* Moreover, the stakeholders' regular platform meetings which was conducted periodically throughout the project life has encouraged partners to play their role in providing training and connecting for wage employment in specific skills. The conducted dialogue and discussions encouraged partners to take responsibilities in their part and this work collaboration was compared to the baseline value and it showed significant change in problem solving and decision making for specific tasks. The base line study confirmed that there were no any specific meetings held between TVT and Enterprises for cooperative training purpose. *Refer base line study done in November2021 under section 4 project outcome indicators.*

According to TVT Colleges cooperative training approach has brought innovative solutions in connecting job seekers for job opportunity in the process of on-job- training at enterprises venue. TVT Colleges appreciated Enterprises practical interest to discuss on training and job linkage working relationship. The job offer orientation and recruitment process which were started from TVT colleges were also seen as a new experience. Implementing this project has improved their relationship in networking TVT level students' for apprenticeship training and

job linkage opportunities. And this beginning was considered as an eye opening relationship for TVT colleges.

The project evaluation showed that, the project is able to adapt one general work readiness training manual which can be used for all industry sectors up on close consultation of sector experts and TVT college trainers. The content of the curriculum was validated with the presence of experts from Enterprises and TVT Colleges. As compared to the base line study finding, this is an impressive achievement since, there was no any training module in garment sector which mainly developed based on employers' demand and trainees' gap. Moreover, the job readiness training manual is being used and adapted by targeted TVT colleges as basic life skill training for every level graduates and garment short term trainees. Particularly, the N/Silk Polytechnic college garment department head has said that, *``I have seen a tendency of complementing the job readiness training as a basic life skill training by other implementing actors who are working with the college``*.

Public TVT College interviewees were also revealed that previously massive numbers of low skilled job seekers in the locality were designated for self-employment and this approach is being challenged with shortage of business start- up tools/ capitals and working premises. In addition, they have stated the general strategy at TVT that, the level one garment trainees in short term training which mainly takes 6 months training for certification and it usually lacks job linkage opportunity. According to them the short-term cooperative training platform project can be used as an alternative approach for the above targets since it has employment linkage services with enterprises mainly at garment factories.

The evaluation findings revealed that, the job readiness training which was introduced by SCOTTEWAY project has brought a system changes. Targeted TVT colleges and implementing actors are noticing the advantage of equipping graduates with job readiness training as part of life skill training. Moreover, implementing actors and TVT colleges are employing the job readiness training for long term level graduates as well. These practices are expected to be scaled-up at other non- targeted colleges as the implementing actors are taking the good lesson for their targets too.

2.1.2 Effectiveness

Effectiveness	Highly unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Satisfactory	Highly satisfactory
Level of satisfaction of the project's key actors including job seekers with the services they received				X
Results identified by project actors and job seekers				X
Level of satisfaction in creating sustainable platform for training			X	
Level of satisfaction in creating sustainable platform for job opportunity	X			

Finding 3: Satisfaction level of the project's key actors including job seekers with the services they received were assessed and mixed results were found.

The views and experiences of the project trained job seekers and employed women were collected. The satisfaction level of targets regarding the job readiness training and job opportunity was rated.

Over all, the survey finding ensured that out of the 88 respondents` 86(97.8%) were highly satisfied with the work readiness training they received at public TVT Colleges. Job readiness training was rated as a great asset to develop the skills needed to lead successful life on the job such as respecting work rules, time management, communication; teamwork and problem solving were listed as the major ones among other topics. Additionally, job seekers confirmed that the training has given an idea on how to deal to their day to day life opportunities and challenges.

Despite the different needs and expectations; the introduced cooperative training and job linkage opportunities were considered as promising platform. Job seekers, the project`s main actor to be benefited, were rating as highly satisfactory for the service they received in job

readiness training and for all other efforts that the project has exercised such as networking for on-job-training and employment opportunity. However, their satisfaction level for the created job opportunity was rated as low. According to the depth response through telephone survey the majorities, more than 84% of, the respondents were answered from neutral to strongly disagree responses for the induction they received at the factories. According to the respondents the salary/benefit package and job position which was discussed during job orientation sessions lacks consistency with the session held at the factory. The job offer and positions were found less and different. Despite to the salary and work arrangement changes other benefit packages such as transportation, child care service and working hour inconvenience were cited as pushing factor and due to this about 78% of respondents left the factory within short period of time. Some who still working in the factories were also unsatisfied with the salary and benefit package they are getting from the company. Very few left the factory with a complaint in doing the same routine work which will not allow them to master the standard garment operation skill. The garment factory turnover rate was estimated between 15 to 20% during the base line study. Similarly, this figure was continued the same during the end line evaluation.

The key informants from targeted Woreda LEID offices expressed their high level of satisfaction with the job seekers training enrolment process at their office. According to the experts the created platform enabled them to easily communicate and network with TVT Colleges at their locality. The platform was taken as an opportunity to extend the network with enterprises at their locality. Unlike to this the information collected from the Woreds revealed that, before this project there were no specific one to one working relationship between Industries and public TVT colleges even enterprises have no detail information about public TVT college training services in the locality. This was happen because previously the enterprise and TVT linkage and relationships were mainly focused at higher city labor and enterprise bureau level. This structural hierarchy created: 1) a barrier for labor actors in creating easily accessible relationship and 2) doubt with government lead office. However, the recent structural changes brought the labor enterprise and industry development office at Woreda level and the office is trying its best to lobby enterprises for training and job linkage using its mandate. Similarly, the interview at targeted public TVT colleges indicated that, the job readiness training which is designed for women and youth with low level of education is a very good platform and can be easily adapted and given at public TVT colleges with free of charge to benefit the local economy by increasing the availability of skilled workers and providing individuals with opportunities to contribute to the local workforce. Consistently, the evaluation findings at targeted garment factory owners and human resource experts indicated a very good impression over the created platform of the project. The platform enabled them to network with Woreda LEID offices, TVT and MG Consultancy. The garment factories said that, *“through this network accessing trained*

job seekers were possible` however; the internal and external challenges of labor sector limited the expected benefits from this platform. According to their experience accessing organized employment agencies around production sites is rare as a result their company recruits through notice board around the street and post outside production compound. Sometimes current employees networking and informal brokers are used to satisfy their labor demand.

The enterprises interview on securing stable labor revealed that, labor turnover has continued as a devastating challenge even with this project. According to them, the workers who are linked through this project were not committed to pass through the factories working procedure that mostly starts from support work to develop basic skills. In the garment factories any new entrants either with or without garment training are expected to pass through with the support works such as clothespin, ironing, packing, brocading and others. Someone who committedly passes this process will move up to all rounded production line and increase their wages over time, this on average takes up to six months. However, job seekers are focusing on high salary and benefits without basic skills which mainly required by factories. According to garment factories, there are considerable benefits through process for instance performance incentives from piece rate calculation which mostly worth than their monthly basic salary. Moreover, stable job seekers can also benefit paid time off from annual and holiday leaves. And have the right to ask formal work experience whenever they leave the factory. These benefits can be achieved through process otherwise, it is impossible to reach in attractive wages without meeting factories expectation and standards. This is mainly because; the factories are dealing with multiple challenges such as lack of sustainable and timely availability of inputs such as local textile inputs, machinery spare parts(needle), intermittent electric supply, lack of production site for expansion and volatile demand for mass-production. These all conditions have had negatively impacted the factories to increase revenue therefore, to mitigate the challenges and stay competitive in the sector factories are forced to reduce budgets for wage and benefit packages.

Finding 4: Results identified by project actors and job seekers

Evidence from KII at TVT and Enterprises confirmed that the project has brought the right strategy in bridging the gap between potential employers and job seekers by creating a support platform with public TVT and Enterprises for job seekers in developing the necessary skills and experience to become job-ready. It ensured networking the trained job seekers with enterprises for entry level job opportunity through on-job- training with the aim of enabling job seekers to master the skill and sustain employment. Moreover, evidence from the interviews and surveys conducted by this evaluation showed that, the created platform has got acceptance and appreciation in-terms of reaching each partner goal and benefiting job seekers in training and job opportunity however, the identified challenges under finding 3 from job

seekers and enterprises side were the hindering factor to meet the intended objective of the platform. For instance, the general living cost increments on food, transportation, child care services, working hours and house rent were identified as a big challenge for job seekers to consider the long-term benefits of garment factory work. The evaluation findings showed that job seekers who were recently employed through this platform were significantly declined the employment offer. According to the survey result out of the 88 interviewed targets 47% of them left the factory and preferred to continue unemployed, 31% of them are doing casual works for its time freedom and convenience to attend their children. The rest 19% joined wage employment in other sectors. The interviewed targets were mentioning that the entry level salary at factories is considerably low and can't compensate the living and child care service costs. Some others were saying that the wages offered not worth enough to the effort and time they spent. This finding was supported by one of the enterprise HR expert interview that, currently the daily casual work payment is about 300 to 400 birr therefore, those who are highly struggling with living cost prefer to join such works for its quick money. The enterprise interviewees also added that, the situation of high labor turnover is continued as undefined problem and the factories are busy to fill the gap of labor turnover.

The Woreda LEID office experts' interview ensured that, significant numbers of job seekers were returned back to the office after they secure wage employment at factories. Among all the following were documented as a major pushing factor for quitting their job: low wage and benefit packages like transportation and child care services. Moreover, working position arrangement change happened at the factories were disappointed some of the job seekers since, this was completely opposite from their prior information they received during recruitment process at Woredas by factory representatives. This work arrangement has compromised the promised basic salary and job seekers expectation to start on-job-training in machine operation.

Finding 5: Project Sustainability and its Challenges

Operating a regular platform throughout the duration of the project increased awareness and the established partnership demonstrated the likelihood of the project's sustainability; However, the level of cooperation expected from labor market actors was much lower than expected and had a major impact on the process of Institutionalization of the cooperative training between TVT and companies.

The quarterly project reports and month-to-month tracking reviews confirmed the improvement of a strong partnership between targeted public TVT and enterprises' however; incentives for training and administrative services provided by other labor market actors in public TVT schools were hindered to coordinate activities accordingly. In addition, the extensive

support programs for jobseekers and companies affected the project to continue the training coordination and job matching of.








For most Enterprises the external support received from project implementers were seen as a very good opportunity since the cost of on-job-training will be covered by implementers, this was taken as an advantage to access free labor for at least six months. In another part, some other Enterprises were judging this incentive as unsustainable by referring to the unsuccessful experiences they had with NGOs with the same approach. According to them, the job seekers who developed practical skills left the factory to fulfilling the unrealistic dream to receive support from NGOs and the government in self-employment jobs, this highly affected the plan and it was quoted as the major reason for early dropouts of trainee employees. The factory HR Manager stated that in profit-making organizations, big dropouts aren't tolerable because companies are losing their effort, useful resource and time to develop the skill of the prospective employees. The TVT colleges' interview supported this finding and most of the job seekers who were linked for on-job-training or apprenticeship are usually stayed until they develop the basic skills of the garment operation, this mostly interferes the working relationship between TVT and Industries.

Conclusion and Recommendation

- The project's strategy was found highly relevant in bridging supply and demand side actors' challenges. The project's key partners have been seen working closely to meet their own challenges. However, the project was highly challenged to continue exercising its cooperative training modality. Because other implementing actors distorted the process of institutionalizing the cooperative training modality between TVT and Enterprises. Even within this condition, the government sectoral actors can further strengthen; ensure institutionalizing the TVT and Industry linkage in the locality through a regular platform to raise awareness of the benefits of working together within their catchment areas. Through this process actors will take responsibilities' in training, hiring and salary and benefit improving steps for jobseekers sustainably.
- Key informant interview with garment enterprises shown that, the garment factory is labor- intensive, and it usually provides a stable job and the opportunity to learn new skills. However, this can be only achieved through workers commitment and obeying orders of the operation managers. All in all, despite the cost of living challenges, job seekers should first consider the long-term benefits that garment factories offer. However, it is job seekers decision to choose the long term prospects by taking in to consideration the effort they are exerting at work place over the wages and benefits they are getting in return.

- The enterprises' interview indicated that; salary and benefit package increment is measured based on worker's commitment and hard work which is mostly achieved over time. This worker management strategy is helping the factories to stay competitive in the sector. However, the strategy has its own impact in decreasing the number of job seekers looking for employment in garment factories. In addition, the labor turnover is forcing factories to post daily vacant announcements and hiring schedules. This all, in return will negatively impact the productivity of the company in; 1) increasing costs for the recruitment process and 2) meeting the required production level. Moreover, the job seekers survey revealed that, low wage & routine work, high living costs, lack of transportation & child care services, and inflexible working hours are documented in this study as pushing factors.
- The survey interview confirmed that, out of the mobilized job seekers, young women who have children showed their interest in the job offer than young who did not give birth this indicates that, getting a stable task force will be possible if the factories consider benefit packages like transportation and child care services for young women with children. In this connection, sectoral government actors, policy makers, and NGOs are expected to find a way on creating an equitable labor market. Among other things, sectoral governments can be involved in helping enterprises to afford transportation services for workers, NGOs can support to start-up child care services and policy makers should talk about minimum wage.
- The project evaluation found the following:
 - Strengthening Cooperative Training for Enhanced Employment of Women and Youth (SCOTTEWAY) Project Intervention has contributed in developing a strong working relationship between TVT and Garment factories. This platform enabled the key project partners to work closely together to overcome their challenges by identifying their mutual interests and showed work collaboration in specific role.
 - One- to -one working relationship created by this project in the locality has brought promising benefits in meeting the interest and needs of supply and demand side actors. Partner interviews were shown that both TVT colleges and Enterprises are specifically benefiting from accessing and networking with job seekers from their locality through the Woreda labor enterprise industry development office. However, creating sustainable jobs in the garment industry remained a problem, as job seekers are challenged to manage living costs with the beginner-level wage and benefit package.

Annexes

 SCOTEEWAY base line report.docx	 questionnair-for KII and job seekers surve	 Quantitative analysis.docx	 Full Application Submission Template	 No Cost extention request with Justifica	 Annex 2b - Workplan (Dec16 to Jan30,202
 ToR for stakeholders and key relevant act	 Qau one Report - final.docx	 Semi annual report from July to Dece,20	 Quar3 report from Jan 01 to March31,2	 Quar4 from Apr 01 to June20,2022.docx	 Quar5June21 to September -including
 Project Lunching Workshop Report.doc	 Stakeholders meeting report.docx	 Stakeholders meeting report-Comm	 August,202 update.docx		